

Appendix C

STAG Appraisal Summary Tables (ASTs)

Southern Distributor Route and Wittet Drive Link (Option F)			
Name and address of authority or organisation promoting the proposal: (Also provide name of any subsidiary organisations also involved in promoting the proposal)		Moray Council High Street Elgin Moray IV30 1BX	
Proposal Name:	Southern distributor route and Option A.	Name of Planner:	The Moray Council
Proposal Description:	This option combines Option A (Wittet Drive Link) with upgrading a route following Reiket Lane through to Glen Moray Drive to form a southern distributor route.	Estimated Total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	Capital costs/grant £32.4m (2007 prices) inclusive of an inflation factor, and optimism bias and risk allowances which combined account for 46% of the estimated costs.
			Annual revenue support
			Present Value of Cost to Govt. £31.2m
Funding Sought From: (if applicable)	Capital funds from the public and private sector, The Moray Council, HITRANS and Scottish Executive, and developer contributions.	Amount of Application:	To be confirmed.
Background Information			
Geographic Context:	Elgin is the principal administrative and commercial centre of Moray with the most recent figures (2001 Census) revealing a population of almost 21,000. The town has a wider catchment population of close to 100,000. It is evident that transport plays an important economic and social function within the context of Elgin. The Edgar Road section of this option is a key commercial area within Elgin, and is the location of the Edgar Road Retail Zone, a key employment site that is in the process of expanding. Connecting Edgar to Wittet Drive will require a new link that will travel through agricultural land. The Wittet Drive area is a residential settlement within Elgin.		

<p>Social Context:</p>	<p>This option combines a Wittet Drive link to Glen Moray and Reiket Lane to form a southern distributor route. This will improve access to a range of education and training facilities including Elgin High School and, through a reduction of traffic on The Wards, to Moray College. It will also promote improved accessibility to Dr Gray's Hospital and The First Day Hospital for the Elderly. By reducing traffic on The Wards access to Elgin Rail Station and for Grampian Fire and Rescue services, is also likely to improve.</p> <p>No Community Regeneration Area, or European Structural Fund areas will be affected by this option.</p>
<p>Economic Context:</p>	<p>The aim of this option is to impact positively on local transport conditions within Elgin. Elgin has two main access roads the A96 and A941 that allow travellers to move through and in and around the area. These connect surrounding communities to the centre of Elgin, to key employment sites and provide access to a range of public services and recreational opportunities.</p> <p>Elgin is the commercial centre of the wider Moray area providing a focus for employment and commercial activity. The service sector dominates the Moray economy with 75% of employees jobs in service sector occupations. Widespread deprivation is not a significant factor within Elgin, although at the small area level particularly at the datazone level a certain degree of social and economic weaknesses exist.</p> <p>The rate of unemployment in Elgin is marginally higher than the Moray average with figures from the Scottish Executive's February Economic Profile showing that two of the five wards within Moray with the highest rate of unemployment were located in Elgin (Cathedral 3.5%, New Elgin 2.9%). An analysis of travel to work patterns shows the dominance of the private car with 51% of households having access to at least one car. The average distance travelled to work in Elgin according to the Census of Population in 2001 was 14km.</p> <p>The development context within Elgin is largely positive with demand for housing relatively strong and commercial developments also positive. Key aims of the local plan include identifying sites for 950 houses for Elgin and to identify within Elgin sites for industrial/commercial development.</p>

Planning Objectives	
Objective:	Performance against planning objective:
<p>Key Planning Objective</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To provide a quicker, safer and more reliable transport system in and around Elgin while accommodating future development. <p>Sub Objectives</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To reduce average junction delay times by introducing junction time improvements on the A96 and A941 for traffic egressing and accessing key junctions from the base year scenario; ▪ To minimise delay and disruption to all mode users caused by the conflict of modes on key routes in and around Elgin; ▪ To improve safety for all road users by reducing the number of road accidents in and around Elgin; ▪ To improve the management of parking in Elgin; ▪ To encourage modal shift from private car to public transport, cycling and walking; ▪ To mitigate the risks of adverse environmental impacts caused by motorised vehicular traffic in and around Elgin; ▪ To ensure integration of land use and transport. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Yes – model results show that this option will improve journey times and ease congestion within Elgin. Although the option will increase road-space in Elgin there will negligible impacts on safety and security. The option complements the wider development context in Elgin. ▪ Yes – model results shows improvements at key junctions when compared to the do-minimum scenario. ▪ Yes – model results show improvements to average vehicle speed. This will benefit all road-users. ▪ It is estimated that the impacts on accident levels will be neutral, despite increasing road-space within Elgin. ▪ No - The STAG Part 1 Appraisal recommended a parking strategy for Elgin be developed. ▪ No – This option will not impact directly on the provision of improved public transport services. Any modal shift impacts through reductions in congestion will be minor. ▪ Yes – This option will improve traffic flow and reduce congestion in Elgin and impact positively on emissions levels. ▪ Yes - This option complements existing land-use policies in Elgin and Moray.
Rationale for Selection or Rejection of Proposal:	In accordance with STAG process and consistent with Planning Objectives.

Implementability Appraisal			
Technical:	As with all of the options, there are no specific unusual technical aspects identified at this stage.		
Operational:	There are no factors which might adversely affect the ability to operate the proposal over its projected life without additional costs.		
Financial:	The funding mechanism has not been completed as part of this STAG Part 2 Appraisal. The estimated capital cost of this option is £32.4m (2007 prices) inclusive of an inflation factor, and optimism bias and risk allowances which combined account for 46% of the estimated costs.		
Public:	The STAG Part 2 Appraisal of this option follows on from a Pre-Appraisal and STAG Part 1 Appraisal that encouraged a wide range of views from local stakeholders in Elgin and Moray.		
Environment			
Mitigation Options Included: (Costs & Benefits)	An Environmental Report has been produced to accompany this STAG Part 2 report. The Environmental Report outlines a number of potential mitigation measures that could be implemented for this option. Mitigation measures will require further exploration as the route design develops.		
Sub-objective	Qualitative Information	Quantitative Information	Significance of Impact
Noise and Vibration	94 properties on the link between Wittet drive and The Wards would receive increase in noise level of 5.1dB, 1 property on the new link between the A96 and Wittet Drive would receive an increase in noise level of 5.7dB. The information generated by a Stage 2 assessment is not sufficiently detailed to specify mitigation measures. However, there are a number of measures available that could be considered as the route	Moderate Negative	Moderate Negative

	design develops. These measures would include: roadside noise barriers, low noise surfacing or speed restrictions.		
Air Quality - Overall	Air Quality standards in Elgin are much higher than the Scottish average. This option maintains the positive Air Quality levels within Elgin.	Minor to Moderate Positive	Minor to Moderate Positive
CO ₂ - Global	CO ₂ levels in Elgin are much lower than the national average. This option maintains the positive CO ₂ levels within Elgin.	Moderate Positive	Moderate Positive
PM ₁₀ - Local	PM ₁₀ levels in Elgin compare favourably to national average rates. This option has a minor positive impact on PM ₁₀ levels within Elgin.	Minor Positive	Minor Positive
NO ₂ - Local	NO ₂ levels in Elgin compare favourably to national average rates. This option has a minor positive impact on NO ₂ levels within Elgin.	Minor Positive	Minor Positive
Water Quality, Drainage and Flood Defence	Impacts to water resources after mitigation measures are implemented will be neutral.	Neutral	Neutral
Geology	Little or no impact.	Neutral	Neutral
Biodiversity	The Wards Wildlife site and Dunkinty Woodland will both be impacted by this option. Following mitigation there will be minor negative impacts.	Minor Negative	Minor Negative.

Visual Amenity	Sensitive visual receptors in the vicinity of this option include: Wittet Drive properties, Bilbohall Farm, Edgar Road properties, Bardon Place properties, Glen Moray Drive properties, Sandy Road properties, Birnie Road properties, Thornhill Road properties, Reiket Land properties, The Wards, Greenwards Primary School, The Magic Roundabout Childcare Centre and a listed residential property at Wittet Drive.	Neutral	Neutral
Agriculture and Soils	This option will sever five fields associated with farm holdings. The implementation of mitigation measures will help ensure impacts are neutral.	Neutral	Neutral
Cultural Heritage	Little or no impact	Neutral to minor negative	Neutral to minor negative
Landscape	No river crossings, 1 railway crossing, 750m of new highway required.	Neutral	Neutral

Safety			
Sub-objective	Item	Qualitative Information	Quantitative Information
Accidents	Change in Annual Personal Injury Accidents	The estimated change in vehicle kilometres of vehicles on the highway network was calculated to be less than 1% when this scheme option was modelled together against the do-minimum scenario. Therefore, the change in the occurrence of accidents/personal injury accidents was calculated to be negligible.	Not applicable
	Change in Balance of Severity	This option promotes increased traffic volume for Wittet Drive, Glen Moray Drive and Reiket Lane which are largely residential areas. This will impact on the local severance level moving it from slight to moderate.	Slight to Moderate.
	Total Discounted Savings	Not applicable	£0
Security		This option will not impact directly on improving public transport services. There will therefore be minimal impact on the security of users of public transport. Improving the road network introduces improved materials, signage and lighting which can produce positive security impacts. This option promotes increased traffic volume moving through Wittet Drive, a largely residential area. This will impact adversely on local security for	Slight to Moderate.

		cyclists and pedestrian's moving through Wittet Drive.	
--	--	--	--

Economy (Transport Economic Efficiency) (2002 discounted prices)			
Sub-objective	Item	Qualitative Information	Quantitative Information
User Benefits	Travel Time	Journey time savings resulting from the introduction of this option are delivered to consumers and business sector. (Consumer £16.8m, Business £9.5m)	£26.3m
	User Charges	There will be no impact on user charges.	£0
	Vehicle Operating Costs	Net change in vehicle operating costs will largely be derived from changes to vehicle speed. (Consumers £1.5m, Business £0.4m)	£1.9m
	Quality / Reliability Benefits	This option will improve journey time reliability.	N/A
	Carbon Benefits	This option will produce marginal carbon benefits.	£0.15m
Private Sector Operator Impacts	Investment Costs	This option will not impact on private sector investment costs.	£0m
	Operating & Maintenance Costs	This option will have a marginal impact on operating and maintenance costs.	-£0.22m
	Revenues	This option will not impact on private sector revenues.	£0
	Grant/Subsidy payments	This option will be part funded by developer contributions.	-£0.96m

Economy (Economic Activity and Location Impacts)			
Sub-objective	Item	Qualitative Information	Quantitative Information
Economic Activity and Location Impacts	Local Economic Impacts	Not applicable	Not applicable
	National Economic Impacts	Not applicable	Not applicable
	Distributional Impacts	Not applicable	Not applicable
Integration			
Sub-objective	Item	Qualitative Information	Quantitative Information
Transport Interchanges	Services & Ticketing	This option will not impact directly on improved public transport services.	Not applicable.
	Infrastructure & Information	This option promotes improved journey times for all vehicles (public and private) moving through and around the Elgin area.	Not applicable.
Land-use Transport Integration		This option complements land-use policies in Moray and Elgin. This includes the Moray Structure Plan and the current and emerging Moray Local Plan.	Not applicable.
Policy Integration		This option is consistent with the Moray Local Transport Strategy (2001) and the HITRANS Regional Transport Strategy. This option contributes to, and is consistent with, a range of government policies, including the 2004 Transport White Paper and the recently published National Transport Strategy.	Not applicable.

Accessibility & Social Inclusion			
Sub-objective	Item	Qualitative Information	Quantitative Information
Community Accessibility	Public Transport Network Coverage	This option will not directly impact on public transport network coverage. The main beneficiaries will be car owners. However, those travelling by public transport, in the main by local buses (326, 327, 328, 329, 331 and 336) will also experience improved accessibility as traffic flow improves and congestion eases. The establishment of new road space will also provide opportunities to review existing bus routes and promote new bus services. The journey time savings are outlined in the Economy section of this report.	Not applicable.
	Access to Other Local Services	This option will promote improved access to the centre of Elgin, which is the commercial focus for Elgin and the Moray Area. This will improve access to key employment sites and a range of community services.	Not applicable.
Comparative Accessibility	Distribution/Spatial Impacts by Social Group	Levels of social exclusion in Elgin are relatively low. As the main beneficiaries will be existing car owners it is likely that any social inclusion impacts will be modest.	Not applicable.

Distribution/Spatial Impacts by Area	This option will promote improved access within and through Elgin. Improvements to the local transport network are viewed as vital for the future economic development of Elgin and the wider Moray area. A number of wards and datazones within Elgin exhibit relative measures of geographic and employment deprivation.	Not applicable.
--------------------------------------	--	-----------------

Cost to Public Sector (2002 discounted prices)		
Item	Qualitative information	Quantitative information
Public Sector Investment Costs	£32.4m (2007 prices) including optimism bias.	£30.3m (present value)
Public Sector Operating & Maintenance Costs	This option will impact on operating and maintenance costs	£0.8m
Grant/Subsidy Payments	Developer contributions will part finance this option.	-£0.96m
Revenues	There will be no impact on revenues	£0
Taxation impacts	Loss of fuel duty	£1.08m
Monetised Summary		
Present Value of Transport Benefits	£27.1m	
Present Value of Cost to Government	£31.2m	
Net Present Value	-£4.1m	
Benefit-Cost to Government Ratio	0.86:1	